Supreme Court, U.S.
FILED
05 18 JUN 27 2005
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

No. 04-

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

ARLINGTON CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT
BOARD OF EDUCATION,

Petitioner,

v.

PEARL MURPHY and THEODORE MURPHY,

Respondents.

ON PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE
UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI

RAYMOND G. KUNTZ*
JEFFREY J. SCHIRO
KUNTZ, SPAGNUOLO, SCAPOLI
& SCHIRO, P.C.
Attorneys for Petitioner
Post Office Box 396
Route 22, Hunting Ridge Mall
444 Old Post Road
Bedford Village, NY 10506
(914) 234-6363

* *Counsel of Record*

195030

COUNSEL PRESS
(800) 274-3321 • (800) 359-6859

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

I. Does the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (the "IDEA")'s attorneys' fees shifting provision, 20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(3)(B), authorize a court to award "expert" fees to the parents of a child with a disability who is a prevailing party under the IDEA?

II. Did the Circuit Court err in affirming the district court's partial award to the prevailing parents pursuant to the IDEA's attorneys' fees shifting provision, 20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(3)(B), for the services of an "educational consultant"?

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Questions Presented	i
Table of Contents	ii
Table of Cited Authorities	iv
Table of Appendices	xiv
Opinions Entered in this Case	1
Statement of Jurisdiction	1
Statute Involved in this Matter	1
Statement of the Case	2
I. Statement of Facts	2
II. The Decision of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit	11
Reasons for Granting the Petition	14
I. The Court of Appeals erred in holding that the IDEA's attorneys' fees shifting provision authorizes a court to award expert fees to the parents of a child with a disability who is a prevailing party under the IDEA	14
A. The IDEA contains no explicit statutory authority for the recovery of expert fees	15

Contents

Page

B. *Casey* does not endorse an elevation of legislative history over the absence of explicit statutory authority for the recovery of expert fees under the IDEA 17

C. The Circuit Court erred in relying on legislative history to construe the IDEA as providing for the recovery of expert fees 19

D. Public policy does not require recovery of expert fees in IDEA proceedings ... 22

II. The Circuit Court erred in permitting, under the IDEA's attorneys' fees shifting provision, 20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(3)(B), the recovery of a non-testimonial expert assisting parents in an impartial due process hearing without the guidance of a licensed attorney 25

A. The IDEA does not provide for the compensation of individuals with special knowledge or training for accompanying and advising parents at impartial hearings 27

Conclusion 29

TABLE OF CITED AUTHORITIES

Page

Cases:

Application of the Bd. of Educ. of the Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist., Appeal No. 99-65 (SRO Dec. 14, 1999) 8

A.R. v. New York City Dep't of Educ., 407 F.3d 65 (2d Cir. 2005) 15, 21

Arons v. New Jersey State Bd. of Educ., No. 85 Civ. 209, 1987 WL 10808 (D.N.J. May 12, 1987), *aff'd*, 842 F.2d 58 (3d Cir.), *cert. denied*, 488 U.S. 942 (1988) 27, 28

Arons v. New Jersey State Bd. of Educ., 842 F.2d 58 (3d Cir.), *cert. denied*, 488 U.S. 942 (1988) 27, 28

B.D. v. DuBuono, 177 F. Supp. 2d 201 (S.D.N.Y. 2001) 28

B.K. v. Toms River Bd. of Educ., 998 F. Supp. 462 (D.N.J. 1998) 28

Borough of Palmyra Bd. of Educ. v. R.C., No. 97 Civ. 6119, 31 IDELR ¶ 3 (D.N.J. July 29, 1999) .. 10, 11, 27

Brillon v. Klein Indep. Sch. Dist., 274 F. Supp. 2d 864 (S.D. Tex. 2003), *aff'd*, 100 Fed. Appx. 309 (5th Cir. 2004) 16, 17, 23

Buckhannon Bd. & Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Dept. of Health & Human Res., 532 U.S. 598 (2001) 15, 26

Cited Authorities

Page

Butler v. South Glens Falls Cent. Sch. Dist., 106 F. Supp. 2d 414 (S.D.N.Y. 2000) 22

Burlington Northern R.R., Co. v. Oklahoma Tax Comm'n, 481 U.S. 454 (1987) 20

Caminetti v. United States, 242 U.S. 470 (1917) ... 20

Collinsgru v. Palmyra Bd. of Educ., 161 F.3d 225 (3d Cir. 1998) 10

Connors v. Mills, 34 F. Supp. 2d 795 (N.D.N.Y. 1998) 10, 11, 27

Crawford Fitting Co. v. J.T. Gibbons, Inc., 482 U.S. 437 (1987) 16, 19

Cynthia K. v. Board of Educ. of Lincoln-Way High Sch. Dist., No. 95 Civ. 7172, 1996 WL 164381 (N.D. Ill. Apr. 1, 1996) 14

Eirschele v. Craven County Bd. of Educ., 7 F. Supp. 2d 655 (D.N.C. 1998) 14

Goldring v. District of Columbia, No. 02 Civ. 1761, slip op. (D.D.C. May 26, 2004) 14, 17

Goldring v. District of Columbia, No. 02 Civ. 1761, slip op. (D.D.C. July 21, 2004) 18, 19, 20, 21

Greenland Sch. Dist. v. Amy N., 358 F.3d 150 (1st Cir. 2004) 4

Cited Authorities

Page

Hayes v. Board of Educ. for the Cape Henlopen Sch. Dist., No. 02 Civ. 55, 2003 WL 105482 (D. Del. Jan. 3, 2003) 10

Heldman v. Sobol, 962 F.3d 148 (2d Cir. 1992) 5

In re Arons, 756 A.2d 867 (Del. 2000), *cert. denied*, 532 U.S. 1065 (2001) 27, 28

J.C. v. Regional Sch. Dist. 10, 278 F.3d 119 (2d Cir. 2002) 26

Lawrence v. Houston, 172 A.D.2d 923, 567 N.Y.S.2d 962 (3d Dep't 1991) 27

Mayo v. Booker, 56 F. Supp. 2d 597 (1999) 14

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 1258, slip op. (N.D.N.Y. Aug. 12, 1999) 6

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 9294, slip op. (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 21, 1999) 6

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 9294, 1999 WL 980164 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 28, 1999) 7

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 9294, 1999 WL 1140872 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 10, 1999) 7

Cited Authorities

Page

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 9294, 2000 WL 10255 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 5, 2000) 8

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., No. 99 Civ. 9294, 2000 WL 28260 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 13, 2000) 8

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., 86 F. Supp. 2d 354 (S.D.N.Y. 2000) 9

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., 297 F.3d 195 (2d Cir. 2002) 9, 10

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., 99 Civ. 9294, 2003 WL 21694398 (S.D.N.Y. July 22, 2003) 1, 5, 9, 10, 11, 27, 28

Murphy v. Arlington Cent. Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., 402 F.3d 332 (2d Cir. 2005) ..... *passim*

Neosho R-V Sch. Dist. v. Clark, 315 F.3d 1022 (8th Cir. 2003) 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 19, 20

New York State Ass'n for Retarded Children v. Casey, 711 F.2d 1136 (2d Cir. 1983) 13

P.G. v. Brick Township Bd. of Educ., 124 F. Supp. 2d 251 (D.N.J. 2000) 28

Polera v. Board of Educ. of the Newburgh Enlarged City Sch. Dist., 288 F.3d 478 (2d Cir. 2002) 3

Cited Authorities

	Page
R.B. v. Board of Educ. of New York, 99 F. Supp. 2d 411 (S.D.N.Y. 2000)	22
Rodriguez v. United States, 480 U.S. 522 (1987)	20
Schmelzer v. State of New York, 363 F. Supp. 2d 453 (E.D.N.Y. 2003)	7
School Comm. of Burlington v. Department of Educ., 471 U.S. 359 (1985)	4, 23
S.D. v. Manville Bd. of Educ., 989 F. Supp. 649 (D.N.J. 1998)	28
Shanahan v. Board of Educ. of the Jamesville - DeWitt Sch. Dist., 953 F. Supp. 440 (N.D.N.Y. 1997)	14
Straube v. Florida Union Free Sch. Dist., 801 F. Supp. 1164 (S.D.N.Y. 1992)	28
T.D. v. LaGrange Sch. Dist. No. 102, 349 F.3d 469 (7th Cir. 2003)	12, 14, 15, 17
Thompson v. Board of Special Sch. Dist. No. 1, 144 F.3d 574 (8th Cir. 1998)	22
United States v. Albertini, 472 U.S. 675 (1985)	19
United States v. Erikson P'ship, 856 F.2d 1068 (8th Cir. 1988)	20
United States v. Ron Pair Enter., 489 U.S. 235 (1989)	20

Cited Authorities

Page

Vultaggio v. Board of Educ., 343 F.3d 598 (2d Cir. 2003) 26

Weast v. Schaffer, 377 F.3d 449 (4th Cir. 2004), *cert. granted*, __ U.S. __, 125 S.Ct. 1300, 161 L.Ed. 104 (2005) 23, 24, 25

Wenger v. Canastota Cent. Sch. Dist., 146 F.3d 123 (2d Cir. 1998) 10

West Virginia Univ. Hosp., Inc. v. Casey, 499 U.S. 83 (1991) ..... *passim*

Statutes:

20 U.S.C. § 1400(d)(1)(A) 2

20 U.S.C. § 1401(8) 3

20 U.S.C. § 1401(11) 2

20 U.S.C. § 1401(15)(A) 2

20 U.S.C. § 1412(a)(1)(A) 2

20 U.S.C. § 1412(a)(3)(A) 2

20 U.S.C. § 1412(a)(10)(C)(i) 4

20 U.S.C. § 1412(a)(10)(C)(ii) 4

20 U.S.C. § 1412(a)(11)(A)(ii)(II) 3

Cited Authorities

	Page
20 U.S.C. § 1414(d)	2, 23
20 U.S.C. § 1415	14
20 U.S.C. § 1415(b)	23
20 U.S.C. § 1415(b)(6)	3
20 U.S.C. § 1415(d)(1)	10, 24
20 U.S.C. § 1415(d)(2)	24
20 U.S.C. § 1415(e)(4)(B)	10
20 U.S.C. § 1415(f)(1)	3, 25, 26
20 U.S.C. § 1415(f)(2)(A)	24
20 U.S.C. § 1415(g)	5
20 U.S.C. § 1415(h)(1)	25
20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(2)	6
20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(2)(A)	6
20 U.S.C. § 1415(i)(3)(B)	*passim*
28 U.S.C. § 1406(a)	6
28 U.S.C. § 1821(b)	14, 17
42 U.S.C. § 1988	12, 13, 18, 20

Cited Authorities

	Page
42 U.S.C. § 1988(b)	18
42 U.S.C. § 1988(c)	14, 16, 18
N.Y. Educ. Law § 1804 (McKinney Supp. 2005)	2
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4402(1)(b)(1) (McKinney Supp. 2005)	2
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4402(2)(b)(2) (McKinney Supp. 2005)	3
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4404 (McKinney Supp. 2005)	5
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4404(1) (McKinney Supp. 2005)	3
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4404(2) (McKinney Supp. 2005)	6
N.Y. Educ. Law § 4404(3) (McKinney Supp. 2005)	6
N.Y. Jud. Law § 476-a (McKinney 1983)	27
N.Y. Jud. Law § 478 (McKinney Supp. 2005)	27
N.Y. Jud. Law § 484 (McKinney Supp. 2005)	27